



CITY OF DUBLIN.

Land Use and
Long Range Planning
5800 Shier-Rings Road
Dublin, Ohio 43016-1236

Phone/ TDD: 614-410-4600
Fax: 614-410-4747
Web Site: www.dublin.oh.us

PLANNING REPORT

PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION

APRIL 8, 2010

CASE INFORMATION

- 1. NE Quad PUD, Subarea 5B – Chase Bank** **7675 Sawmill Road**
09-054FDP/CU **Final Development Plan/Conditional Use**

Proposal: A 4,210-square-foot bank with a drive-thru and associated site improvements within Subarea 5B of the NE Quad Planned Unit Development District. The site is located on the west side of Sawmill Road, approximately 150 feet south of the intersection with Emerald Parkway.

Request: Review and approval of a final development plan under the Planned District provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.050, and a conditional use under the provisions of Zoning Code Section 153.236.

Applicant: Thomas N. Moffatt, Chase Bank; represented by Aaron L. Underhill, Smith & Hale.

Planning Contact: Claudia D. Husak, AICP, Planner II.

Contact Information: (614) 410-4675, chusak@dublin.oh.us

Case Summary

This is a request for review and approval of a final development plan for a 4,210-square-foot banking facility with a drive-thru, 50 parking spaces and other associated site improvements. This is also a request for review and approval of a conditional use for a five-lane drive-thru. It is Planning's opinion that the proposed site design and architecture is compatible with the character of the surrounding area and recommends approval of both requests with conditions.

Background and History

The rezoning for this site was approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission on March 18, 2004 and by City Council on May 17, 2004. The rezoning and preliminary development plan includes Subareas 5A and 5B of the Northeast Quadrant Planned Unit Development District. Subarea 5A encompasses 27.95 acres and includes the Kroger Marketplace Shopping Centre, two multi-tenant outparcel buildings and a fuel station. Final development plans for this Subarea were approved by the Commission in 2004.

The rezoning and preliminary development plan did not include any site layout details for Subarea 5B as no particular development was anticipated at the time and the PUD process did not require much detail other than a development text. The approved site layout, landscaping and

architectural style evident in Subarea 5A are generally viewed as setting the development pattern for this site.

Site Description

Location

Subarea B of the NE Quad PUD is a 10.87 acre, irregularly shaped parcel, bounded by Sawmill Road to the east, Summer Drive (private) to the south and Emerald Parkway to the west and north. The subject of this application is a 2.79-acre portion of this parcel, located in the southeast corner, west side of Sawmill Road immediately north of the intersection with Summer Drive. The site has approximately 400 feet of frontage along Sawmill Road and 300 feet along Summer Drive.

Site Character

The site and the parcel are undeveloped with several tree stands located in the southeast corner, along the northeastern boundary and in the center, spanning the entire parcel from north to south. There are no other significant natural features. There appears to be some ponding in the southern portion. A sidewalk was installed along the boundary with Emerald Parkway.

Surrounding Zoning and Uses

The site and parcels to the north, west and south are zoned PUD, Planned Unit Development District as part of the Northeast Quadrant plan. To the north and west are apartments and townhomes of the Scioto Crossing residential development. To the south is the Kroger Marketplace Shopping Centre, with the Kroger Marketplace store and the shopping center. It includes two multi-tenant outparcel buildings oriented toward Sawmill Road and a Kroger fuel station located in the northeast portion of that site. Summer Drive, a private road, is the boundary between the 10-acre NE Quad, Subarea 5B subject parcel and the Subarea 5A Kroger Marketplace site. To the east, across Sawmill Road, is commercial land within the City of Columbus.

Plan Description

Overview

The applicant is requesting approval of a final development plan for the development of a 2.79-acre site with a 4,210-square-foot, one-story banking facility centrally located on the site, with parking along the south, and east sides and a conditional use for a 5-lane drive-thru (auto-oriented commercial facility) along the north side. The proposal includes three access points, a sizable stormwater management pond and extensive landscaping.

Final Development Plan Description

Overview

The final development plan is the last step in the development of a Planned District and requires that all site development details be approved by the Planning and Zoning Commission. The final development plan indicates adherence to all requirements of the approved development text.

Proposed Layout Details

The final development plan includes about 2.8 acres of the 10.87-acre Subarea 5B. The site will be developed with a one-story bank facing Sawmill Road. A sidewalk is proposed along Summer

Drive and a meandering bikepath along Sawmill Road. A large stormwater management pond, serving the Chase Bank site and other portions of the overall parcel is located along the southern boundary of the site, where the healthy and sizeable existing trees will be preserved. A sidewalk will be provided from the Sawmill Road bikepath to the front of the building. Mounding and landscaping are shown along the Sawmill frontage with the same treatment as the Kroger Marketplace site.

A five-lane drive-thru, proposed along the northern building elevation, includes one teller lane, an ATM lane, two remote service lanes, and a bypass lane. Planning is concerned that the 60 foot exit drive from the drive-thru lanes is too wide and should be narrowed significantly by increasing the landscape areas on either side.

Development Standards

The approved development text permits retail or restaurant (full service, no drive-thru) uses only for the two outparcels in Subarea 5B, the remainder of the Subarea must be developed with uses permitted in the Suburban Office and Institutional District of the Zoning Code. The text requires a 50-foot building and pavement setback from Sawmill Road and a 60-foot building setback and 35-foot pavement setback along Summer Drive. The permitted density is limited to 10,000 square feet per acre.

Predetermined Parcel Access

Full access to this parcel was predetermined at the rezoning stage and includes an access point on Summer Drive west of the subject site and directly opposite the main access point for Kroger. While not necessary with the development of the Chase site, it was anticipated at the rezoning stage that the overall parcel include a main drive, connecting two predetermined access points, one opposite the main Kroger access point and the other off Emerald Parkway between Sawmill Road and Wyandotte Woods Boulevard.

Planning encouraged the applicant to include a plan illustrating a potential build-out of the parcel and its internal circulation pattern. This plan has been included but will not be a part of the approval for this application. Although recognizing that the plan is speculative, Planning has advised the applicant that the plan does not account for a logical and direct connection between the two pre-determined access points.

Chase Site Access

The applicant is proposing to install an east-west drive to provide a connection from the parcel's main access point to the Chase Bank site. This drive, upon entrance to the site, makes an immediate 90 degree turn to the east, which does not permit an adequate throat for stacking of vehicles. Additionally, the proposed drive creates a small pocket of unusable land along its south side and hinders the overall circulation pattern of the entire parcel. The applicant has agreed that this access drive be temporary and that a future final development plan for the development of the remainder of the parcel include the removal of this drive once a connection through the site is made, as described above.

The proposal includes two additional access points: a right-in/right-out access drive off Sawmill Road, and a right-in/right-out access drive off Summer Drive, just west of the access for the Kroger fuel station on the adjacent parcel.

Traffic Study

The applicant has prepared a Traffic Impact Study to justify the request for two additional access points to serve Chase. Sawmill Road is under the jurisdiction of the City of Columbus and the proposed access point of that road has been approved by Columbus. Based on the traffic study, the new Sawmill Road access point will attract a large percentage of the site traffic. The additional right-in/right-out on Summer Drive is not necessary from an engineering standpoint, but is requested by the applicant to provide additional access for the front of the site.

Architecture

The text requires that buildings have the same degree of exterior finish on all sides and reflect a suburban office of residential character. Architectural style, materials, and colors must be consistent and coordinated with Subareas 5A. The architecture is similar to the Kroger Marketplace Centre and includes a hipped roofline, dormers, and an unlighted cupola. The main building materials are brick and stone with EIFS used for the drive-thru. The building includes a stone accent course above the windows and doors. The roof material is proposed to be dimensional asphalt shingles.

The proposed elevations include an overhang for the ATM drive-thru lane. This particular feature does not demonstrate the same high level architecture as the rest of the building and Planning recommends that a shed-style roof be provided in place of the flat-roofed overhang.

Parking

The proposed text requires that 36 parking spaces be provided in accordance with the Zoning Code, at one space per 250 square feet of building area, plus one space per employee on the largest shift. The 4,210-square-foot building requires 16 spaces and the applicant has indicated that the bank will have a minimum staff of 19 employees. Fifty spaces are provided.

Sidewalks and Bikepaths

A sidewalk is on the east side of Emerald Parkway and another is proposed along the north side of Summer Drive. A sidewalk connection will connect the front door of the bank to the bikepath along Sawmill Road. The site includes a proposed eight-foot wide meandering bike path along Sawmill Road with landscaping. The City has recently established a Bicycle Advisory Task Force (BATF) and comments made by its members suggest that bicyclist prefer a straight path to provide a more direct route (although these comments were not directly related to this project). While the bikepath along Sawmill Road meanders in front of Subarea 5A and the applicant was instructed to recreate that effect, it is the City's current position that this path should be straightened, but designed to avoid existing trees.

Landscaping

The text requires compliance with the Zoning Code's landscaping requirements, which will require adjusting the location of two trees along the eastern boundary. The applicant has provided the Sawmill Road landscape treatment that was approved for Subarea 5A and includes

evergreen and deciduous shrubs interplanted with flowering and shade trees in addition to a bikepath that gently meanders through a series of three-foot six-inch high mounds.

- *Retention Pond Plantings.* The applicant has elected to enhance the retention pond as a site amenity, with wetland plantings, a seating area with brick pavers, benches and a stone band along the banks of the pond. Planning recommends black benches in place of the proposed red.
- *Vehicular Use Screening.* The screening proposed along Summer Drive to meet the vehicular use area-screening requirement includes *Densiflora* Yew and Sea Green Juniper, which matches the plant material on the south side of Summer Drive.

Tree Preservation

The eastern and southern boundary of the site includes mature trees in good condition. The applicant has preserved and incorporated a number of the existing trees into the landscape plan, however 110 caliper inches of protected trees will be removed. The proposed landscape plan reflects 22 replacement trees for a total of 55 caliper inches. The applicant has elected to mitigate the remaining 55 caliper inches through financial means in order to avoid overplanting the site.

The proposed egress drives require the removal of 89 caliper inches of protected trees which are mitigated with 36 replacement trees. The trees are proposed to be planted along Summer Drive and Emerald Parkway. Planning recommends the applicant install the Emerald Parkway standard four-foot to six-foot mound prior to planting the replacement trees. The landscape beds and flowering trees which complete the Emerald Parkway landscape treatment may be installed when the remainder of the site is developed.

Signs

Sign requirements in the development text are the same for Subarea 5B as Subarea 5A, restricting letter height to no more than 30 inches, the graphic span to 80 percent of the front façade, the number of colors to three, and bronze for the return sides of all letters. Signs must meet Code in all other aspects. Except for center identification signs, all signs for Subarea 5A are wall signs. The applicant is proposing two wall signs, one along the Sawmill Road frontage and one along the Summer Drive frontage. Code only permits a second sign if a site has frontage along two public streets. Summer Drive is a private street and a second sign is not permitted.

The wall sign is shown at a height of 16 feet, 6 inches, which exceeds the Code permitted height of 15 feet. The applicant will be required to lower the sign to comply with Code. The proposal includes individual channel letters, internally illuminated at the 30-inch letter height permitted by the text. It also includes the Chase logo which is slightly taller than the letters and should be reduced in height to be in line with the logo. The letters are to be white and the logo is proposed to be blue (Pantone 300). The final development plan for Subarea 5A included specific approved colors and there was concern amongst the Commissioners regarding the brightness of the internally illuminated wall signs. It is Planning's opinion that using different colors for Subarea 5B is appropriate; however the illumination intensity of the wall signs should be similar in both subareas.

The plans include several on-site directional signs, which all meet Code.

Lighting

The proposed plan meets lighting requirements of the development text with 28-foot tall poles and fixtures to match existing lighting.

Stormwater Management/Utilities

Utility service is being accommodated by an eight-inch sanitary sewer extension to an existing manhole located on the west side of Sawmill Road and a 12-inch waterline on the east side of Sawmill Road. These services are being supplied by City of Columbus mains, but the applicant is required to pay City of Dublin tap fees.

The applicant will be responsible for complying with the City's Stormwater Management and Stream Protection Ordinance and Stormwater design manual. The site will also need to comply with Ohio Environmental Protection Agency's (OEPA) National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permit - Authorization for Storm Water Discharges Associated with Construction Activity.

PLANNING ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

Review Criteria – Final Development Plan

Section 153.055(B) of the Code identifies criteria for the review and approval for a final development plan. Following is an evaluation by Planning based on those criteria. The criteria are arranged in the following categories and may be in a different order than listed in the Code:

Adopted Policies and Plans (Criteria 1, 3, 9, & 10). The proposed modifications conform to the approved preliminary development plan, have adequate public facilities and open spaces, are carried out in progressive stages, and conform to all other applicable zoning text and Code requirements.

Criteria met. The proposal conforms to the preliminary development plan in terms of permitted use, lot coverage, and setbacks.

Site Safety and Circulation (Criteria 2 & 5). The proposed modifications provide for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulation and provide adequate lighting for such uses.

Criteria met with conditions. The site provides adequate lighting and safe and efficient pedestrian circulation. The drive-thru exit should be narrowed significantly by increasing the landscape areas on either side to decrease unnecessary pavement and provide a clearer indication of appropriate vehicular movements (Condition 1).

The internal east-west access drive between the two Summer Drive access points is to be temporary and the drive must be removed at the time the connecting drive between the westernmost access point and the preplanned access point on Emerald Parkway is constructed in order to provide more efficient and safe vehicular circulation (Condition 2).

In order to meet a desire of the BATF, the applicant should work with Planning to straighten the Sawmill Road bikepath while locating it sensitive to existing trees (Condition 3).

Development Details (Criteria 4, 6, 7, & 8). The details of the development are sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site, include appropriate landscaping and signs, and provide adequate storm drainage.

Criteria met with conditions. The proposed plans meet the preliminary plan with regard to landscaping and are sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site.

Planning recommends that the proposed elevations include a shed-style roof along the northern elevation above the ATM drive-thru lane in order to maintain a high quality architectural style along all sides of the building (Condition 4).

Two trees along the site's eastern boundary should be moved closer to the pavement to meet the vehicular use area screening (Condition 5). Planning further recommends the applicant install the standard Emerald Parkway four-foot to six-foot mound prior to planting any required replacement trees (Condition 6).

The second sign proposed along Summer Drive, a private road, is not permitted by Code and must be removed (Condition 7). The height of the Chase logo must be lowered to 30 inches to meet the development text and the sign lowered so that the top of the sign does not exceed 15 feet from grade (Condition 8). Additionally, the level of illumination for the wall signs should include three layers of color film to be consistent with those approved for Subarea 5A (Condition 9). Sheet A8 showing building elevations includes a Chase sign atop the ATM, which is not permitted by Code and should be removed from the plans (Condition 10).

Planning recommends that the benches for the pond site amenities be black instead of red (Condition 11).

Recommendation: Approval with Conditions

In Planning's opinion, this proposal complies with the preliminary development plan, the final development plan criteria and the existing development standards within the area. Approval is recommended with conditions.

Conditions

- 1) That the drive-thru exit be narrowed significantly by increasing the landscape areas on either side, subject to approval by Planning;
- 2) That the internal east-west access drive between the two Summer Drive access points be temporary and be removed at the time the connecting drive between the westernmost access point and the preplanned access point on Emerald Parkway is constructed;
- 3) That the bikepath along Sawmill Road be straightened, while avoiding existing trees, subject to approval by Planning;
- 4) That the proposed elevations include a shed-style roof along the northern elevation above the ATM drive-thru lane, subject to approval by Planning;

- 5) That two trees along the site's eastern boundary be moved closer to the pavement to meet the vehicular use area screening;
- 6) That the standard Emerald Parkway mound be installed prior to planting any required replacement trees;
- 7) That the wall sign along Summer Drive be removed;
- 8) That the height of the Chase logo be lowered to 30 inches and that the entire wall sign be lowered so that the top of the sign does not exceed a height of 15 feet from grade;
- 9) That the wall sign include three layers of color film to be consistent with Subarea 5A;
- 10) That the sign atop the ATM shown on sheet A8 be removed; and
- 11) That the benches along the pond be black instead of red.

Conditional Use

Overview

The drive-thru for the bank is located on the north side of the building, facing the internal access drive of Sawmill Road. The drive-thru includes one teller lane, an ATM lane two remote service lanes, and a bypass lane.

Layout

The drive-thru is accessed off the main drive aisle around the bank and exits onto the internal north-south drive (See final development plan for comments related to the drive-thru exit). All but the ATM and the bypass lane are under the main roof of the building and Planning has requested that as part of the final development plan, the applicant include a shed-style roof for the ATM overhang.

Stacking

The Code requires eight stacking spaces for a bank drive thru and the applicant has indicated that it is the desire of Chase to maintain stacking for five vehicles. The stacking diagram indicates that there is adequate stacking for six vehicles in each drive-thru lane. Based on the operational needs of this business and decreased need to create expansive paved areas for additional vehicles to stack, Planning supports the applicants request to decrease the number of stacking spaces. (Section 153.236(C)(2) permits the Planning and Zoning Commission to approve deviations from development standards through the review and approval of a conditional use.)

PLANNING ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

Review Criteria (Conditional Use)

Section 153.236(C) sets out criteria of approval for a conditional use. The following is an evaluation by Planning based on those criteria. The criteria are arranged in the following categories and may be in a different order than listed in the Code.

Policies of the Community (Criteria 1 & 2). The proposed use will be harmonious with and in accordance with the specific objectives of the Zoning Code and/or Community Plan and comply with all applicable development standards.

Criteria may be met through waiver by Commission: Auto-oriented commercial facilities including drive-thrus are characteristic of commercial areas and banks in particular, which are permitted in this PUD.

Chapter 153.236 of the Zoning Code requires that for conditional uses the proposed use complies with all applicable development standards, except as specifically altered in the approved conditional use. The Commission as part of this approval may alter the required stacking spaces for this use to six per lane.

Impact to the Surrounding Community (Criteria 3, 4, 6, 9, & 10). The proposed use will be harmonious with the existing or intended character of the general vicinity, will not be hazardous to or have a negative impact on surrounding uses, will not be a detriment to the economic welfare of the community or property values in the immediate vicinity, and will not impede the orderly development of the surrounding properties.

Criteria met. The proposed drive-thru will be harmonious with the existing and intended commercial character of this area and will not impede the orderly development of the surrounding properties.

Necessary Infrastructure (Criteria 5, 7 & 8). The area and proposed use(s) will be adequately served by essential public facilities and services and will have vehicular approaches that are appropriately designed to not create interference with traffic on surrounding public or private road systems.

Criteria met. The drive-thru will be adequately served by the proposed infrastructure as evident in the final development plan and with the applicable conditions outlined in the final development plan will not create interference with traffic on surrounding public or private road systems.

Recommendation: Approval.

In Planning's opinion, this proposal complies with the Conditional Use review criteria and approval of this request is recommended.

FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN

Final Development Plan

The purpose of the Planned Unit Development process is to encourage imaginative architectural design and proper site planning in a coordinated and comprehensive manner, consistent with accepted land planning, landscape architecture, and engineering principles. The PUD process consists of up to three stages:

- 1) Concept Plan (Staff, Commission, and/or City Council review and comment);
- 2) Zoning Amendment Request (Preliminary Development Plan; Commission recommends and City Council approves/denies); and
- 3) **Final Development Plan (Commission approves/denies).**

The intent of the final development plan is to show conformance with and provide a detailed refinement of the total aspects of the approved preliminary development plan (rezoning). The final development plan includes all of the final details of the proposed development and is the final stage of the PUD process. The Commission may approve as submitted, approve with modifications agreed to by the applicant, or disapprove and terminate the process. If the application is disapproved, the applicant may respond to Planning and Zoning Commission's concerns and resubmit the plan. This action will be considered a new application for review in all respects, including payment of the application fee. Appeal of any action taken by the Commission shall be to the Court of Common Pleas in the appropriate jurisdiction. Following approval by the Commission, the applicant may proceed with the building permit process. In the event that updated citywide standards are applicable, all subsequently approved final development plans shall comply with the updated standards if the Planning and Zoning Commission determines that the updated standards would not cause undue hardship.

Review Criteria

In accordance with Section 153.055(B) *Plan Approval Criteria*, the Code sets out the following criteria of approval for a final development plan:

- 1) The plan conforms in all pertinent respects to the approved preliminary development plan provided, however, that the Planning and Zoning Commission may authorize plans as specified in §153.053(E)(4);
- 2) Adequate provision is made for safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular circulation within the site and to adjacent property;
- 3) The development has adequate public services and open spaces;
- 4) The development preserves and is sensitive to the natural characteristics of the site in a manner that complies with the applicable regulations set forth in this Code;
- 5) The development provides adequate lighting for safe and convenient use of the streets, walkways, driveways, and parking areas without unnecessarily spilling or emitting light onto adjacent properties or the general vicinity;
- 6) The proposed signs, as indicated on the submitted sign plan, will be coordinated within the Planned Unit Development and with adjacent development; are of an appropriate size, scale, and design in relationship with the principal building, site, and surroundings; and are located so as to maintain safe and orderly pedestrian and vehicular circulation;

- 7) The landscape plan will adequately enhance the principal building and site; maintain existing trees to the extent possible; buffer adjacent incompatible uses; break up large expanses of pavement with natural material; and provide appropriate plant materials for the buildings, site, and climate;
- 8) Adequate provision is made for storm drainage within and through the site which complies with the applicable regulations in this Code and any other design criteria established by the City or any other governmental entity which may have jurisdiction over such matters;
- 9) If the project is to be carried out in progressive stages, each stage shall be so planned that the foregoing conditions are complied with at the completion of each stage; and
- 10) The Commission believes the project to be in compliance with all other local, state, and federal laws and regulations.

CONDITIONAL USE REVIEW

REVIEW STANDARDS

Conditional Uses

Conditional uses, while often desirable, may more intensely affect the surrounding area in which they are located than permitted uses. The intent of the conditional use process is to set forth development standards and criteria for locating and developing a conditional use in accordance with the nature of the surrounding area, conditions of the development, and with regard to appropriate plans. The Planning and Zoning Commission is the final stage in approving or disapproving a conditional use.

The conditional use request includes all of the details of the proposed use, and the Commission may approve, disapprove, or approve with modifications. Upon a favorable finding, the Commission shall approve a conditional use application within 30 days following the public hearing. Appeal of any action taken by the Commission shall be to the Court of Common Pleas in the appropriate jurisdiction. Following approval by the Commission, the applicant may proceed with the building permit process. A Certificate of Zoning Plan Approval for a conditional use must be issued within one year of Planning and Zoning Commission approval, or the approval expires.

Review Criteria

Section 153.236(C) sets out criteria of approval for a conditional use. Following is an evaluation by Planning based on those criteria. Section 153.236(C) sets out criteria for the review and approval of a conditional use.

(C) *Action by the Planning Commission.* The Planning and Zoning Commission shall hold a public hearing and shall not approve a conditional use unless it finds that such use at the proposed location meets all of the following requirements:

- 1) The proposed use will be harmonious with and in accordance with the general objectives, or with any specific objective or purpose of the Zoning Code and/or Community Plan.
- 2) The proposed use will comply with all applicable development standards, except as specifically altered in the approved conditional use.
- 3) The proposed use will be harmonious with the existing or intended character of the general vicinity and that such use will not change the essential character of the same area.
- 4) The use will not be hazardous to or have a negative impact on existing or future surrounding uses.
- 5) The area and proposed use(s) will be adequately served by essential public facilities and services such as highways, streets, police, and fire protection, drainage structures, refuse disposal, water and sewers, and schools; or that the persons or agencies responsible for the establishment of the proposed use shall be able to provide adequately any such services.
- 6) The proposed use will not be detrimental to the economic welfare of the community.
- 7) The proposed use will not involve uses, activities, processes, materials, equipment and conditions of operations, including, but not limited to, hours of operation, that will be detrimental to any persons, property, or the general welfare by reason of excessive

- production of traffic, noise, smoke, fumes, glare, odor or other characteristic not comparable to the uses permitted in the base zoning district.
- 8) Vehicular approaches to the property shall be so designed as not to create interference with traffic on surrounding public and/or private streets or roads.
 - 9) The proposed use will not be detrimental to property values in the immediate vicinity.
 - 10) The proposed use will not impede the normal and orderly development and improvement of the surrounding property for uses permitted in the district.